

TRANSLATION SHIFTS OCCURRENCE IN THE MANDARIN-ENGLISH AND ENGLISH-INDONESIAN TRANSLATION OF “FAIRY TALE” SONG

Gabriella Melani

Department of English Letters, Faculty of Letters,
Universitas Sanata Dharma, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
gmelani82@gmail.com

Abstract

The translation is not only limited to the activity of conveying the meaning from one language to the other language. When a text is translated, the form and language system may also be shifted because every language has its unique characteristics. This shift may confuse new language learners who usually translate a text in a literal way. Analyzing the shifts that occurred in different language pairs could show the process of how the form was shifted between these languages. This research analyzes the comparison of translation shifts found in Mandarin-English translation and English-Indonesian translation of the song “Fairy Tale” by Michael Wong. A song is chosen to be analyzed because the method of learning a new language from popular songs is often recommended, and Michael Wong’s “Fairy Tale” fits the criteria. This paper applied a qualitative research method in analyzing the data. The data of Mandarin-English lyric translation was obtained from the subtitle or the transcription in the official music video of Michael Wong’s “Fairy Tale” on YouTube. The data of the English-Indonesian lyric translation was obtained from the same official music video by using the auto-translate feature provided on YouTube. Catford’s theory regarding translation shift was used to analyze the obtained data. Based on the analyzed data, the intra-system shift is expected to occur the most in both of the different language pairs as a result of the different language systems possessed by each of the languages.

Keywords – Auto Translate, Lyric Translation, Subtitling, Translation Shift

Introduction

In Indonesia, the job-seeking phenomenon seems to be one of many interesting topics to be discussed, especially by college students in their final years of study. Almost every job applications provided by companies require proficiency in the English as a standard skill to be possessed (Karja, 2020, para. 1). However, one would think that if someone is proficient in more than two languages, the chances of being hired would be higher.

Besides English, Mandarin might be the other beneficial language to be mastered as many companies from China have established their new branches in Indonesia. Brands originated from China such as TikTok, Vivo, and Xiaomi are some of them. These foreign companies would want to hire job-seekers who are proficient in another language besides

English (Adieb, 2021, para. 20). Therefore, to get a higher chance to be hired in the desired company, job-seekers might have to master English and Mandarin. Besides learning the languages formally in an institution, job-seekers can also learn from the translations of foreign song lyrics that can be accessed on YouTube’s subtitles as an additional way of practicing.

By reading and understanding the source text and the target text of the foreign song lyrics, the learners may learn new words or phrases, which will increase their knowledge about the language. According to Newmark (1998), translation converts source language text’s meaning into the target text, while also keeping the author’s original messages (p. 5). Translation can also be in the form of multimedia translation often discovered in videos subtitles.

Cintas and Remael (2014) define subtitling as a form of translation that provides a text shown on the lower part of the screen or monitor (p. 9). For most of the time, YouTube videos provided subtitles from other languages to cater to all people worldwide. However, some videos did not have certain language subtitles. In this case, people can utilize YouTube's auto-translate feature to obtain the subtitles' translation.

Auto-translate feature in YouTube is considered as a machine translation. Machine translation, according to Hutchins (1995), refers to a translation that was produced by a computer system without any help from a human (p. 431).

A new problem may arise when a text is translated. The system and the form of the language may be shifted due to the unique characteristics. New language learners who often translate a text in a literal way might be confused because of this occurrence. This occurrence is also known as translation shift. According to Catford (1965), the shift which occurred in translation refers to "the departure from formal correspondence" when translating from SL to TL (p. 73). In addition, Munday (2016) explains that translation shift mainly occurs on the linguistic level of the source text and target text (p. 95). Catford (1965) mentions that translation shifts can be classified into two. The first is the level shift, while the second is known as the category shift, which can be divided further into four types: structure shifts, class shifts, unit shifts, and intra-system shifts (p. 73).

Mandarin and English might share some identical features. For example, both of these languages have the S-V-O sentence structure. However, there are also many differences between Mandarin and English. Some of them are as follows:

1. The concept of tenses does not exist in Mandarin. Instead, aspect markers, modal verbs, and time adverbials are applied (Liu et al., 2013, p. 81).
2. The predicate in Mandarin is not limited to verbs only. It can also be adjectives, nouns, and even sentences (Teng, 2011, pp. 2-4).
3. The sentences in Mandarin can stand without a subject (Teng, 2011, p. 4).
4. Unlike in English, aside from subject-prominent structure, Mandarin also has a topic-prominent structure (Teng, 2011, p. 5).
5. Mandarin does not possess nonfinite forms of verbs, such as infinitives. Instead, verbs are sometimes combined with objects, modifiers, and auxiliary verbs (Liu et al., 2013, p. 87).

This research aims to analyze the translation shifts found in Mandarin-English lyrics subtitle and English-Indonesian lyrics subtitle of the song "Fairy Tale" by Michael Wong. A song is chosen to be analyzed because the method of learning a new language from popular songs is often recommended, and Michael Wong's "Fairy Tale" fits the criteria. By analyzing the shifts that occurred in Mandarin-English and English-Indonesian language pairs, this research could show the process of how the form was shifted between these pairs.

Methodology

This research analyzes the translations shifts found in the Mandarin-English and English-Indonesian subtitles of the Mandarin song "Fairy Tale" by Michael Wong. The subject of the research is the lines of "Fairy Tales" song lyrics that were translated from Mandarin to English and then from English to Indonesian.

This research applied a qualitative research method in analyzing the data as it deals with non-numeric data. To obtain the data, the researcher accessed YouTube and tried to find the official music video of “Fairy Tale” by Michael Wong. The researcher then checked if Mandarin-English and English-Indonesian lyrics translations are available or provided in the caption of the official music video. After the availability of the translations was confirmed, the data in the form of lyrics translations were obtained. The data of Mandarin-English lyric translation was obtained from the transcription or subtitle found in the official music video of Michael Wong’s “Fairy Tale” on the ROCK RECORDS YouTube channel. The data of the English-Indonesian lyric translation was obtained from the same official music video by using the auto-translate feature provided by YouTube on the ROCK RECORDS channel.

To analyze the data, the researcher applied the library research method and explicatory method. According to George (2008), the library research method identifies and discovers references containing knowledge or facts related to the research (p. 6). The library research method was applied to gain information about Catford’s translation shift theory and Mandarin grammar theory. On the other hand, the explicatory method scrutinizes a text in order to learn more about the details of the text (George, 2008, p. 6). It was utilized to identify and classify the translation shift found in the translations. Catford’s theory regarding translation shift was utilized to analyze the obtained data. The researcher also utilized two books entitled *Side by side Chinese and English grammar* by Liu (2013) and *Yufa! A practical guide to Mandarin Chinese grammar* by Teng (2011) as the references of Mandarin grammar.

Finding and Discussion

Based on the analysis, the researcher found that the intra-system shift occurred the most in the Mandarin-English translation of the song “Fairy Tale.” The same shift also occurred the most in the English-Indonesian translation of the song “Fairy Tale.”

Table 1. The Frequency of Translation Shift Occurrence in Mandarin-English and English-Indonesian Translations of the Song “Fairy Tale.”

No.	Type of shift	Man-Eng Frequency	Eng-Ind Frequency
1	Level	5	5
2	Structure	15	8
3	Unit/rank	8	4
4	Class	14	13
5	Intra-system	20	18
Total		62	48

The Examples of Translation Shifts Occurrence in Mandarin-English and English-Indonesian Translation

1. Level Shift

The example of level shift occurrence can be found in the first line of the first stanza of the song lyric.

Man: 忘 - 了 - 有 - 多久

Wàngle yǒu duōjiǔ

Literal: Forget - [asp.mark] - [estimation] - how long

Eng: I **have forgotten** how long

Ind: Saya **sudah** lupa berapa lama

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin lexis “了,” which functions as an aspect marker that indicates completion of an action, was translated into the grammar “have+v3”. This occurrence happened because tenses do not exist in Mandarin grammar. On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English grammar “have+v3” was translated into Indonesian lexis “sudah.”

2. Structure Shift

The structure shift occurred at both clause level and phrase level. The example of structure shift occurrence in clause level can be found in the second stanza's first line.

Man: 你 - 哭 - 著 - 對我 - 說

Nǐ kūzhe duì wǒ shuō

Literal: You – cry - [asp.mark] - to me - tell

Eng: You cried and told me

Ind: Anda menangis dan memberitahu saya

In the Man-Eng occurrence, there was a shift between the position of the object and the verb at the end of the English translation sentence. In Mandarin, the sentence was written as “你 (S) 哭著 (V) 對我 (O) 說 (V),” while in the English translation, it was translated as “You (S) cried (V) and (Conj.) told (V) me (O)”. In addition, the conjunction “and” was also added to form a correct and acceptable sentence in the English TT. On the other hand, clause level structure shift does not occur in the Eng-Ind language pair.

In the phrase level, the example can be seen in the second line of the second stanza.

Man: 童話 - 裡都是騙人的

Tóng huà lǐ dōu shì piàn rén de

Literal: Fairy tale - in.....

Eng: Things **in** fairy tale are lies

Ind: Hal-hal **dalam dongeng** adalah kebohongan

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin “童話 裡” Head-Post Modifier pattern was translated into English “In fairy tale” with Pre Modifier-Head pattern. On the other hand, phrase level structure shift does not occur in the Eng-Ind language pair of this example.

Another example of phrase level shift can be found in the third line of the first stanza.

Man: 對我說你 - 最愛 - 的 - 故事

Duì wǒ shuō nǐ zuì'ài de gùshì

Literal: ...you – favorite - [possessive] - story

Eng: Telling me **your favorite story**

Ind: Ceritakan **kisah favoritmu**

In this Man-Eng occurrence example, the phrase level structure shift does not occur. On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English noun phrase “your favorite story,” which possesses the pattern Premodifier-Modifier-Head, was translated into the Indonesian noun phrase “kisah favoritmu,” which possesses the Head-Postmodifier-Postmodifier pattern.

3. Unit Shift

The unit shift occurrences in this research involves around phrase, word, and morpheme level. The first example can be found in the first line of the third stanza.

Man: 我 - 願 - 變成 - 童話 - 裡
- 你 - 愛 - 的 - 那個 - 天使

Wǒ yuàn biànchéng tóng huà lǐ
nǐ ài dì nàgè tiānshǐ

Literal: I – hope - turn into - fairy tale – in – you – love - [possessive] – that - angel

Eng: I **would like** to turn into that angel you love in the fairy tales

Ind: Saya **ingin** berubah menjadi malaikat yang anda cintai dalam dongeng

In this occurrence, The Mandarin word “愿” was translated as the English verb phrase “would like.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English phrase “would like” was translated into Indonesian word “ingin”.

The second example can be found in the third line of the second stanza.

Man: 我 - 不 - 可能 - 是 - 你 - 的 - 王子

Wǒ **bù** kěnéng shì nǐ de wángzǐ

Lit.: I – not – possible – be – you – [possessive] – prince

Eng: I **cannot** be your prince

Ind: Saya **tidak** bisa menjadi pangeran anda

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin word “不” was translated as the English morpheme “-not” in the word “cannot.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English morpheme “not” was translated as the Indonesian word “tidak.”

4. Class Shift

The first example of can be found in the third line of the first stanza.

Man: 對我 - 說 - 你 - 最 - 愛 - 的 - 故事

Duì wǒ **shuō** nǐ zuì'ài de gùshì

Lit.: to me-tell-you-favorite-[possessive]-story

Eng: **Telling** me your favorite story

Ind: **Ceritakan** kisah favoritmu

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin verb “说” was translated into English gerund, which functions as a noun, “telling.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English gerund/noun “telling” was translated into the verb “ceritakan” in Indonesian.

The second example can be found in the fifth line of the first stanza.

Man: 我 - 開始 - 慌 - 了

Wǒ kāishǐ **huāng** le

Lit.: I – start – panic – [asp.mark]

Eng: I began **to panic**

Ind: Saya mulai **panik**

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin verb “慌” was translated into English to-infinitive, which

functions as a noun, “to panic.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English to-infinitive/noun “to panic” was translated into the adjective “panik” in Indonesian.

The example of the verb to preposition can be found in the fourth line of the third stanza.

Man: 相信 - 我們 - 會 - 像 - 童話 - 故事 - 裡

Xiāngxìn wǒmen huì **xiàng** tónghuà gùshì lǐ

Lit.: Believe – we – can – like – fairy tale – story – in

Eng: Believe that we will be **like** the ones in fairy tales

Ind: Percayalah bahwa kita akan **sama** seperti yang ada di dongeng

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin verb “像” was translated into the English preposition “like.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English preposition “like” was translated into the adjective “sama” in Indonesian.

The third example can be found in the fifth line of the third stanza.

Man: 幸福 - 和 - 快樂 - 是 - 結局

Xìngfú hé **kuàilè** shì jiéjú

Lit.: Happiness-and-joyful-be-end

Eng: Happiness and **joy** will be our end

Ind: Kebahagiaan dan **kegembiraan** akan menjadi akhir kita

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin adjective “快樂” was translated into the English noun “joy” instead of the adjective “joyful.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English noun “like” was translated into the noun “kegembiraan” in Indonesian.

The fourth example can be found in the third line of the second stanza.

Man: 我 - 不 - 可能 - 是 - 你 - 的 - 王子

Wǒ bù kěnéng shì nǐ de wángzǐ
Lit.: I - not - possible - be - you - [possessive] - prince

Eng: I **cannot** be your prince

Ind: Saya tidak **bisa** menjadi pangeran anda

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin adjective “可能” which means “possible” in English, was translated into the English modal verb “can.” On the other hand, the English modal verb “can” was translated into the verb “bisa” in Indonesian.

The fifth example can be found in the sixth line of the first stanza.

Man: 是不是 - 我 - 又 - 做 - 錯 - 了 - 甚麼

Shì bùshì wǒ yòu zuò cuòle shénme?

Lit.: Yes no yes - I - again - do - wrong - [asp.mark] - something?

Eng: **Did** I do something wrong?

Ind: **Apakah** saya melakukan sesuatu yang salah?

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin question phrase “是不是” was translated into English auxiliary verb “Did.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English auxiliary verb “Did” was translated into the Indonesian pronoun “Apakah.”

The sixth example can be found in the first line of the third stanza.

Man: 我 - 願 - 變成 - 童話 - 裡 - 你 - 愛 - 的 - 那個 - 天使

Wǒ yuàn biàncéng tónghuà lǐ nǐ ài dì nàgè tiānshǐ

Literal: I - hope - turn into - fairy tale - in - you - love - [possessive] - that - angel

Eng: I **would like** to turn into that angel you love in the fairy tales

Ind: Saya **ingin** berubah menjadi malaikat yang anda cintai dalam dongeng

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin modal verb “願” was translated into English verb “would like.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English verb “would like” was translated into Indonesian adverb “ingin.”

5. Intra-system Shift

The first example of the intra-system shift can be found in the third line of the first stanza.

Man: 對我 - 說 - 你 - 最 - 愛 - 的 - 故事

Duì wǒ **shuō** nǐ zuì'ài de gùshì

Lit.: to me-tell-you-favorite-[possessive]-story

Eng: **Telling** me your favorite story

Ind: **Ceritakan** kisah favoritmu

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin verb “说” was translated into “telling,” in which the morpheme or suffix “-ing” was added. On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the suffix “-ing” from English “telling” was not translated into the verb “ceritakan” in Indonesian.

The second example can be found in the fifth line of the second stanza.

Man: 從 - 你 - 說 - 愛 - 我 - 以後

Cóng nǐ **shuō** ài wǒ yǐhòu

Lit.: Since - you - say - love - me - after

Eng: After you **said** you love me

Ind: Setelah kamu **mengatakan** kamu mencintai

In the Man-Eng occurrence, the Mandarin verb “说” was translated into “said,” which is a past simple irregular verb form of “say.” On the other hand, in the Eng-Ind occurrence, the English irregular verb “said” was translated as a normal Indonesian verb