

Indirect Citation Used In The Development Of Review Of Related Literature Of Final Project: A Case Of Students Of The English Study Program Of Universitas PGRI Semarang

Ngasbun Egar^{a,*}, Niken Ayu^b

^aUniversitas PGRI Semarang, Jl. Sidodadi Timur Nomor 24, Semarang 50125, Indonesia

^bUniversitas PGRI Semarang, Jl. Sidodadi Timur Nomor 24, Semarang 50125, Indonesia

*Alamat Surel: ngasbunegar@upgris.ac.id

Abstract

This study aimed at: 1) finding out the citation forms used in developing review of related literature; and 2) finding out the problems in using indirect citation in developing review of related literature of selected final projects.

Analytical qualitative method was used, in which note taking technique was employed to collect the data. The data of the research were taken from final projects written by the students of English study program of Universitas PGRI Semarang. The data was analyzed by identification of the citation forms, and the problems in the use of the indirect citation.

The results show that 1) there are two citation forms employed by the writers: integral and non-integral citations; and 2) there are two dominant problems in the use of indirect citation in developing review of related literature: incomplete sentence, and inconsistency in the use of citation format.

Kata kunci:

Indirect citation, review of related literature, final project

© 2020Dipublikasikan olehUniversitas Negeri Semarang

1. Introduction

Citation refers to the way a writer acknowledge other writer's thoughts, ideas influences his/her writing. Besides, citation in academic writing also counts a lot. This is in line with some references which show that credibility of the works in academic papers, counts a lot (David, 2019). By using citations in academic paper students give assurance to their readers that the material they are writing is proved previously. They learn how to put old evidence in their own individual way. Basically, the citation is an extension of your work to show the reader that you have done proper research on your work. Citation is very important in academic writing, many writers use citation as an object of the research, ... (Novita, 2000).

1.1 Importance of Citation

According to Welljams-Dorof as quoted by Aksnes, Langfeldt, and Wouters (2019), in general, the larger the citation data set being used, the higher the confidence level of the

results. Analyses involving entire fields of research, nations, regions and large universities are virtually unaffected by the concerns and caveats about citation data . . . The confidence level at these large aggregate levels is quite high in analyses of fundamental, basic research. In almost similar manner, Waridah (2017) points out that the use of direct citation and indirect citation is very important to learn by reader because it is closely related to people communication and interaction in everyday life. Sentences that are delivered or spoken and the sentences contained in the teks are often found using direct citation and indirect citation, but some people do not know so that they are not aware that the sentences or sentences contained in the text are direct citation and indirect citation. Direct citation and indirect citation are one of the elements of language in the text which is one of the techniques.

In this regards, Stangler (2018) arises a more detailed description stating that citations are used to show your reader(s) where the information in your paper was originally published. Citations are important because they show your reader(s): when the information was published; who the author of the information is; which journal or group published the information; and which version the information was published in (usually just for literature). All of this information about the information you cite in your papers is important because it not only keeps you from plagiarizing other people's ideas, but it also helps you prove to your reader(s) that you know your topic.

According to Nunn (2010), the writer has many ways to make the summary of the resources in the literature review, they are: Quote, Paraphrase, Summarize, and Citation.

1.2 Forms of citation

As might be widely known, there two forms of citations, i.e. integral and non-integral. This is also pointed out by Okamura (2008) stating that citation forms were divided into integral (syntactically integrated citation) and non-integral (syntactically non-integrated). Integral citation was further categorized into subject position, non-subject position (passive; clause constituent) and noun phrase (adjunct agent structure; phrase constituent), such as "according to.

According to Swales and Feak (2009), there are two types of citation in scientific writing of English there are: integral (author prominent) and non-integral (research prominent) :

- a. Integral citation , example (Claims that there is a consumerist approach emerging in higher education that is " a direct result of the expectation that students contribute a greater a proportion of their education")
- b. Non-integral citation , example (In some urban classroom, children arrive without any notion of sharing behaviour. If they have grown up as street survivor, without strong early mediation for sharing, they may come to school ready to do battle to the death")

Rabab'ah and Al-Marshadi (2013) adopting Swales' (1990) categorization, state that citation is cegorized into two types: integral and non-integral.

1.3 Studies on Citation

Some studies have been conducted on citations forms. The work of Wijaya (2014) focuses on citation style of Indonesian and International writers found in journal articles. The main objective of this study was to discuss the dominant citation style used by Indonesian writers and international writers. This research was a comparative descriptive study. The object of this research was an opening article published in TEFLIN and Asian EFL journals in “2013” consisting of 10 opening research articles for each journal. The data were taken using a checklist and documentation. The results of this study were as follows, inviting authors from Indonesia and internationally to use paraphrases in quotations. The tenses used participates using a simple present tense. In contrast, in prominent quotations Indonesian dominant writers use integral quotations while international writers are valued using non-integral quotations. It can be concluded as in the style of quotation and the form used is between Indonesian writers and international writers, but in terms of leading citation styles with different citing styles.

Ather study was conducted by Kembara (2013). This study was about types of citation which dominantly used by the students of English Study Program in the University of Bengkulu in literature review of thesis. In this study, the researcher used two research methods, checklist and interview to know the types of citation and the reason why the student used one a certain type of citation. The object of the studies are theses that product of the English students that the researcher get using sample method. The result was the citation that students used was still majority wrong.

Another study in this field yet quite different is a study conducted by Ebrahimy (2018). The focus of this study was on the Direct and Indirect Influence Altmetrics on Citation in Social Systems: Assessing a New Conceptual model. This study aimed to assess the paths through which save metrics (on CiteULike, Mendeley, and Figshare) and discussion metrics (on Twitter, Facebook, and Wikipedia) influence citation. This descriptive-correlation study investigates the relationships between different variables based on its proposed conceptual model. Systematic and stratified sampling was employed and, using the Cochran formula, the sample size was determined to be 1892 articles. Data were collected using the PLOS altmetrics, and path analysis was administered to test the conceptual model by using AMOS software. The results convey that Mendeley was the most effective path resulting to citation. Mendeley has a positive and significant relationship with citation via save as an intermediary. Twitter also had a negative and significant relationship with citation via discussion as an intermediating factor. Yet, neither save metrics on CiteULike and Figshare nor discussion on Facebook and Wikipedia does create a path of influence on citation. Identifying the effective paths through which social networks affect citation via altmetrics and presenting a final model of those paths could enrich and expand the theoretical foundations in the field of altmetrics. Besides identifying the most effective social networks and paths for online scientific interactions that lead to citation, the implications of this research can provide deeper insights for policy makers, editors and scholars. The theoretical benefits in this study are able to provide clearer information about theories from the title that the author

adopted regarding indirect citation analysis in using his own language in the final project.

From those studies, it can be summarized that students tend to use different forms of citations in developing their academic writing, and that they face some problems in citing to support their academic writing.

This particular studies, therefore, would try to find out: 1) the citation forms used in developing review of related literature; and 2) the problems in using indirect citation in developing review of related literature of selected final projects.

2. Method

This study is a qualitative analytical study. It focuses on the analysis of textual data. In analytical research, the researcher has to use facts or information already available, and analyzed these to make a critical evaluation of the material (Kothari, 2004). Then, the researcher believes that analytical method is the most appropriate method of this research because the goals of this research is analyzing, and focus the characteristics indirect citation in final project.

The subject of this research is "Final Project". This study focuses on the final project text. More specifically, it focuses on the use of indirect citation in the review of related literature of the final project.

The data was taken from 8 final projects of English Department students graduated in June 2019 at the Universitas PGRI Semarang.

The technique used in collecting the data was note-taking methods (rewriting sentences in the final project which were converted into indirect citation).

3. Findings and Discussion

3.1 Citation forms used in developing the review of related literature

In developing the review of related literature, students tend to use various citation forms. The findings of this study show that there are three ways the students use to develop their review of related literature in their final project, which can be explained as follows:

3.1.1 The use of Integral citation in the first sentence

In the Review of Related Literature, it was found that at all of the first sentences of every paragraph used Integral citation was used. Integral citation is the citation that tend to focus the attention more on the researcher and rather less on the research (Swales and Feak, 2009). In every paragraph of Review of the Related Literature, the first sentence

which is in the passive sentence contains the information that is more focus on the researcher such as the name of the researcher, the title of the paper, the name of journal, the number of journal, and the page of journal. The followings show this:

Table 4.1 Evidence from the Integral Citation

No. Data	Review Related Literature
A.1.1	The first previous study is written by Sermsook, et all (2017) entitled “An Analysis of Errors in Written English Sentences: A Case Study of Thai EFL Students” published on Canadian Center of Science and Education. In the research finding,
B.2.1	The second research was written by (Basra & Thoyyibah, 2017:73) entitled “A Speech Act Analysis of Teacher Talk in an EFL Classroom.”
D.5.1	The fifth previous study was done by Tutuarima, Nuraeningsih, and Rusiana (2018) entitled an Analysis of Speech Act Used in London Has Fallen Movie which published by Vision: Journal for Language and Foreign Language Learning.

3.1.2 The use of non-Integral citation in the second up to the end

In the selected final projects, it was found that almost all of subsequent of their Review of Related Literature non-integral citation was used. Non-integral citation is the citation that consider important information or results of the research. Most of them focused the subsequent sentences by elaborating the contains of their related literature such as the background of the study, the reason of the study, the method, the subject of the study, the object of the study, and the result of the study. The evidence can be seen as follows:

Table 4.2 Evidence from the non-Integral Citation

No. Data	Review Related Literature
D.5.11	The study found that there are locutionary acts, 37 illocutionary acts, and 25 perlocutionary acts.
F.3.3	The researcher discussed about the kinds, meanings and the frequency of figurative language (Methaphor, Similes, and Personification) that is used in every song (Ada Apa Dengan Cinta?, Ketika Cinta Bertasbih, and Cinta Sejati).
H.3.2	The study focused on describing the implementation of authentic assessment to measure students’ English productive skills based on the 2013 curriculum.

3.1.3 The Use of Indirect citation in the first sentence

It was also found out that most of them use indirect citation in every first sentence of the paragraphs, and did not show citation anymore in the middle or in the end of their review of related literature because their citation types are non-integral. The evidence of indirect citation signaled by underlined words which can be seen as follows:

Table 4.1 Evidence from the Indirect Citation

No. Data	Review Related Literature
A2.1	The second study was conducted by <u>Ananda, et al (2014)</u> entitled “A

	<i>Study of Error Analysis from Students' Sentences in Writing</i> published on <i>Studies in English Language and Education Journal</i>
B7.1	And then, the research had been done by <u>(Isnawati, Anam, & Diana, 2015:60)</u> entitled " <i>Speech Acts Analysis of the Main Character in SHREK Movie Script.</i> "
E1.1	The first study conducted was by <u>Fifin and Syamsul Anam (2015)</u> entitled " <i>Speech Acts Analysis Of The Main Character In Shrek Movie Script</i> " a student of Jember University published by "Publika Budaya" volume 1 (3).

The findings of this study was in line with the work of Wijaya (2013) which focuses on the Citation Style of Indonesian and International Writers Found in Journal Articles, where Indonesian writers tend to use integral quotations while international writers tend to use non-integral quotations. Similar to what Wijaya has found out, this study shows the same tendency in which in the eight selected final project of English department students of *Universitas PGRI Semarang* they mostly used integral quotation.

Besides, the findings also support the premise of Swales and Freak (2009), stating that there are two types of quotations in scientific writing in English, namely: integral (main author) and non-integral (leading research). Integral (lead author) is a type of citation that focuses on the author of a reference and emphasizes him, non-integral (leading research) is a type of citation that focuses on references that cite to support ideas. In this process the note taking taknique method. Students must understand the sources to be summarized, understand the meanings of integrals and non-integrals before summarizing and changing to indirect sentences.

This means that in the review of related literature of the final projects, integral citations are more widely used and tend to focus more attention on the researcher, in each paragraph. The first sentence in the passive sentence contains information that is more focused on the researcher such as the name of the researcher, title of the paper, name of the journal, number of journals, and journal page.

Further, these findings also supported the work of Kembara (2013) which focuses on analyzing review of thesis. The researcher used two research techniques: checklist and interview to identify the types of citation and the reason for the student used one of certain type of citation.

3.2 Problems in using citation

The results of the analysis show that there are two dominant problems in using citation in developing review of related literature. Those problems are explained as follows:

3.2.1 Incomplete sentence

Incompleteness of sentence is can be said as a common fenomena of language use. It is more frequently happen in non-native use of language. This also happens in the way the

students develop the review of related literature in their final projects. The followings show the fact:

Based on Bustomi, Ahmad (2009) in the thesis entitle “*An Error Analysis on Students’ Descriptive Writing*” (a case study on students of Harapan Jaya senior high school at Ciponoh, Tangerang).

This excerpt cannot be considered as a sentence, as there is no verb in it. However, it is ended with period. To make it into a correct sentence, it can be completed by making it as the Complement of the sentence and adding it with a sentence as follows:

Based on Bustomi, Ahmad’s (2009) thesis entitled “*An Error Analysis on Students’ Descriptive Writing*” (a case study on students of Harapan Jaya senior high school at Ciponoh, Tangerang), **it can be concluded that....**

Or, it can also be completed like this:

This is based on Bustomi, Ahmad’s (2009) thesis entitled “*An Error Analysis on Students’ Descriptive Writing*” (a case study on students of Harapan Jaya senior high school at Ciponoh, Tangerang).

Similar phenomena also happens in this situation:

According to Etinurwati (2016) in the journal entitled “*An Analysis of Student’s Ability in Using Punctuation in Paragraph Writing*”.

3.2.2 *Inconsistency in the use of citation format*

Another common phenomena found in this particular study was inconsistency in the use of citation format. As might be commonly known, there are at least four forms or style of citation, namely **MLA style** in the humanities, **APA style** in psychology and education, **Chicago** notes and bibliography in history, and **Chicago** author-date in the sciences (Last updated, Sept 29, 2020 4.10 PM, Library System, University of Pittsburg, <https://pitt.libguides.com/citationhelp>).

It was found in this study that there was inconsistency in the use of citation format. The following excerpts show the case:

The first previous study is written by Sermsook, et all (2017) entitled “*An Analysis of Errors in Written English Sentences: A Case Study of Thai EFL Students*” published on Canadian Center of Science and Education.

However, at the same time in another part of the review of related literature it was also found:

The first previous study is written by Sermsook, Liamnimitr, & Pochakorn (2017) entitled “An Analysis of Errors in Written English Sentences: A Case Study of Thai EFL Students” published on Canadian Center of Science and Education.

A case like the followings was also found:

The first previous study was done by Ardita Dylgjeri (2017) entitled “*Analysis of Speech Acts in Political Speeches*” which published by European Journal of Social Sciences Studies.

However in another part of the writing it was also found:

The first previous study was done by **Dylgjeri (2017)** entitled “Analysis of Speech Acts in Political Speeches” which published by European Journal of Social Sciences Studies.

4. Conclusion

From the findings and discussion of this study, it can be concluded as the followings:

4.1 There are two citation forms employed by the writers in developing review of related literature: integral and non-integral citations.

4.2 There are two dominant problems in the use of indirect citation in developing review of related literature: incomplete sentence, and inconsistency in the use of citation format.

References

- AAA Style Guide, (2013) . Referencing and citation style . University of *Chicago* Press
- Aksnes, D.W. , Langfeldt, L., Wouters, P. (2019). Citations, Citation Indicators, and Research Quality: An Overview of Basic Concepts and Theories. First Published February 7, 2019 Research Article.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244019829575>
- Andriani, Pratiwi, & Winaya, (2017) entitled “*Illocutionary Acts in the Movie Script Steve Jobs*.”
- Ardita Dylgjeri (2017). “*Analysis of Speech Acts in Political Speeches*”. published by European Journal of Social Sciences Studies.
- Arsyad, S. (2013) ‘A genre-based analysis on the introductions of research articles written by Indonesian academics.’ TEFLIN Journal
- Australian Vice-Chancellor's Committee's Academic Standards Panel. Economics, (1992) . Canberra
- Baldick, C.(1990) The Concise Oxford Dictionary of Literary Terms. *New York: Oxford University Press*

- Bustomi, A. (2009). "An Error Analysis on Student's Descriptive Writing" . a case study on students of Harapan Jaya Senior high school at Cipinoh, Tangerang.
- Etinurwati (2016) . "An Analysis of Student's Ability in Using punctuation in Paragraph Writing" . Raden Intan Lampung
- David, E. (2019) *What Is A Citation Style & Why It is Important In Academic Writing?* <https://academicwritingpro.com/blog/what-is-citation-its-importance#:~:text=By%20using%20citations%20in%20academic,proper%20research%20on%20your%20work.>
- Deas. S.W (2014) Citation Style of Indonesian and International Writers Found in Journal Articles of TEFLIN and Asian EFL Introductions: A Comparative Study , *University of Bengkulu*
- Dylgjeri (2017) "*Analysis of Speech Acts in Political Speeches*" which published by European Journal of Social Sciences Studies.
- Elo, S.. & Kyngas, H. (2007). *The Qualitative Content Analysis Process*. JAM Research Methodology. Finlandia. University of Oulu Press.
- Feak, C. B. and Swales J. M. (2009) *Telling a Research Story: Writing a Literature Review*. Michigan: The University of Michigan Press
- Hogne (2006). 'Quote exact wording by original writer' TEFLIN Journal
- Kembara (2013) . 'Analyze errors analysis of citation' TEFLIN Journal
- Kothari, C. R. (2004). *Research Methodology: Methods and techniques*. New Age International.
- Maori, (2011). *Academic writing guide* . Victoria University of Wellington
- Mason, J. (2002) *Qualitative Researching*. 2nd Edition, Sage Publications, London.
- Novita (2000) citation important in academic writing . *MIS quarterly*
- Nunan, D. (2010). Quote, paraphrase , summarize , and citation In: Diamond J, Robinson JA *Natural Experiments of History*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press
- Nurwahyuni, (2017) . "An Error Analysis of The punctuation Student's Writing " . *Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta*
- Okamura, A. (2008). *Citation Forms in Scientific Texts: Similarities and Differences in L1 and L2 Professional Writing*, Nordic Journal of English Studies, vol. 7 No. 3, December 2008 61-81. Takasaki City University of Economics, Japan
- Okiy, R.B. (2003). A citation analysis of education dissertations at the Delta State University, Abraka, Nigeria, *Collection Building*, 22 (4)

- Rabab'ah, G. & Al-Marshadi, A. (2013). *Integrative vs. Non-Integrative Citations among Native and Nonnative English Writers*. International Education Studies; Vol. 6, No. 7; 2013 ISSN 1913-9020 E-ISSN 1913-9039 Published by Canadian Center of Science and Education
- Rutz (1977) . AAA Style Guide , direct quotation is a quote that use original word or sentences of the original writer example . Sahlins as cited in Rutz 1977:125) . Dari:<https://www.monmouth.edu/resources-for-writers/documents/aaa-direct-quotes.pdf/> (diakses 30 Mei 2013)
- Sermsook, (2017) . “*An Analysis of Errors in Written English Sentences: A Case Study of Thai EFL Students*” published on Canadian Center of Science and Education
- Stangler, M. (2018). *Introduction to Citations*. Center for Academic Success, <https://www.sctcc.edu/sites/default/files/users/cas/Introduction%20to%20Citations.pdf>)
- Waridah, E. (2017). General Guidelines for Indonesian Spelling & Regarding Indonesian-Language. Bandung: Word Space.
- Wijaya (2014). Previous study is a study about comparing citation style . wijaya 2014 . Dari: <https://www.scribbr.com/citing-sources/citation-styles/> (diakses 18 Agustus 2015)